

**Independent Summary Report to QIA
of the CETT Professionalising the Workforce case studies**

The Quality Improvement Agency (QIA – now part of the Learning and Skills Improvement Service, LSIS) commissioned Dr Joe Harkin to conduct an analysis of the results of case studies of workforce development carried out by Centres of Excellence in Teacher Training (CETTs) and to write a preliminary report as a focus for a symposium held at the University of Warwick on 1 July 2008. The present document is a final report that sets out the results of the case studies and the symposium.

Dr Joe Harkin

October 2008

The structure of the report:

The policy background

The QIA case studies

The findings that emerge from the case studies

- 1. Fundamental challenges to the further education sector**
- 2. The reception of the new qualifications in the Learning and Skills sector**
- 3. The provision of Information, Advice and Guidance about the reforms**
- 4. Delivery of the new qualifications**
- 5. Mentoring teachers during ITE**
- 6. The assessment of the new qualifications**
- 7. Support for teachers of functional skills**
- 8. Progression issues in the qualifications framework**
- 9. The recruitment and development of teacher educators**
- 10. The role of CETTs in promoting workforce reform**

It is a self-evident truth that if learners and employers are to get the very best from the further education service, then teachers, trainers, together with all those engaged in supporting learning, must all be thoroughly professional and highly skilled.

Bill Rammell MP, Minister of State, Lifelong Learning, Further and Higher Education, 2007.

The policy background

DfES (2002) *Success for All: Reforming Further Education and Training - Our Vision for the Future* set out to produce a qualified workforce by 2010. DfES (2004) *Equipping our Teachers for the Future: Reforming Initial Teacher Training for the Learning and Skills Sector* set out a policy of reform of teacher development. DfES (2006) *FE Reform: Raising Skills, Improving Life Chances* introduced further plans for the professionalisation of the further education (FE) workforce, including compulsory continuing professional development (CPD) for all teachers.

From September 2007 all new staff employed as teachers, tutors, trainers, lecturers and instructors (referred to as teachers in this report) in the FE sector must be licensed to practise by the Institute for Learning (IfL). All teaching funded by the Learning and Skills Council (LSC), including work based learning, adult and community learning and offender learning is included in the reforms. To be licensed all teachers must be trained to a standard that allows them to achieve either Qualified Teacher Learning and Skills (QTLS) status or Associate Teacher Learning and Skills (ATLS) status. All teachers should undertake at least 30 hours of CPD a year, with reduced amounts for those on sessional, fractional or part time contracts, and maintain a record of CPD activities undertaken. For in-service trainees this CPD requirement runs concurrently with their initial teacher training.

The distinction between 'full' and 'associate' teacher role is based on the level of responsibility given to the teacher for curriculum planning and assessment and not on the number of hours a person teaches. Associate teachers may, for example, deliver off-the-shelf training packages, whereas a full teacher will be responsible for planning, delivering and assessing learning.

The new teaching qualifications framework consists of:

- Level 3 or 4 Award in Preparing to Teach in the Lifelong Learning Sector (PTLLS) – one mandatory unit worth 6 credits
- Level 3 or 4 Certificate in Teaching in the Lifelong Learning Sector (CTLLS) – four units worth 24 credits, including one optional unit worth six credits.
- Level 5 Diploma in Teaching in the Lifelong Learning Sector (DTLLS) – nine units worth 120 credits, including two optional units worth 15 credits each.

For example, the optional units available in one programme, Westminster CETT Case study (CS) 4 are:

- Year one
 - Inclusive practice
 - Managing and responding to behaviours in a learning environment
- Year two
 - Developing and managing resources
 - The lifelong learning sector
 - Integrating literacy, language and numeracy in the learning of vocational and other subjects
 - Planning and practising embedded approaches to raise learner achievement

Skills for Life (SfL - Literacy, Numeracy and ICT) and English for speakers of other languages (ESOL) teachers not qualified before September 2007 will be required to take a subject specialist DTLLS (CTLLS is not considered sufficient) rather than a generic one.

New teachers must register with the IfL and are required to obtain Qualified teacher or Associate teacher status within five years of registration. In order to qualify for QTLS status, and therefore be eligible to practise as a 'full' teacher, a teacher will

need to take the Level 5 diploma (or hold an equivalent 120 credits), have achieved Level 2 Maths and English qualifications, and a Level 3 qualification in their specialist area. In addition to this, they will be required to participate in 30 hours of Continuing Professional Development (CPD) per year, pro rata.

We recognise that there are a few trainers and teachers who are not yet sure they want to join, or don't like the idea of being required to do so, but I think this will change. Just as doctors, lawyers and schoolteachers are automatically members of a professional body, it will become the norm for FE and skills practitioners to belong to their professional body. Lee Davies, Deputy Director, IfL.

The General Professional Recognition Learning and Skills (GPRLS) scheme offers experienced and skilled members of the workforce (pre-Sept 2007) a route to be considered as a qualified member of the workforce and to gain licensed status.

Teachers in higher education (HE), including those exclusively teaching HE in FE, are exempt from any requirements under the regulations, as are staff in the voluntary sector and work-based learning that is not LSC funded.

. . .in the Voluntary sector, the regulations are not immediately mandatory; we need to comply if we are to continue to maintain our approved status with funding bodies and contractors. CETT for Inclusive Learning CS 5

Sixth-form college teachers were required to be registered either with IfL or with the General Teaching Council for England (GTC(E)) by 30 September 2008.

Finally, before reporting some of the case study findings, it may be helpful to give a few background statistics about ITE in the sector. In 2003, nearly 40 per cent of the FE workforce of about 130,000 teachers were over 50 years old and over a quarter were expected to retire by 2010. In 2004/05, 42,000 candidates were registered on FENTO/SVUK endorsed initial teacher education (ITE) programmes, with an annual intake of 22,900. This arithmetic suggests that teacher education in the sector is a large enterprise that may require more structure and focus than it has at present.

90 per cent of ITE candidates were studying in-service, most of them in the first year of teaching. Candidates from outside FE (e.g. from health and social care, the uniformed services, and the community and voluntary sectors) accounted for 10-25 per cent of HEI based enrolments, and between 10-40 per cent of awarding body based enrolments. The great diversity of learners in ITE in the sector has implications for the recruitment and development of teacher educators.

The QIA case studies

To help gauge the impact of national workforce reforms on teachers, learners and providers and, if possible, to point to ways of improving national strategies for professional development, the Quality Improvement Agency (QIA) invited the eleven Centres for Excellence in Teacher Training (CETTs) to bid for funds to carry out case studies of the local implementation of the new teaching qualifications framework. Nine CETTs (see appendix for their names and abbreviations used in this report) bid for funding and between them produced 81 case studies.

By their nature, case studies are not intended to be generalizable, nevertheless, cumulatively the case studies may clarify the impact of the new workforce reforms on ITE and CPD provision, and may inform the QIA's National Improvement Strategy, the Lifelong Learning UK's (LLUK) Workforce Development Strategy and the IfL's professional development strategy.

Individual case studies, or groups of case studies, may also enhance understanding of local practice in workforce development by, for example,

- Assisting providers to implement workforce development reforms through action research projects.
- Evaluating specific workforce development reforms to identify key success factors, barriers and how they can be overcome.
- Identifying the impact of workforce development reforms on teachers, learners and providers locally.
- Developing the role of the CETTs.

The range of the case studies

Most case studies include a focus on a PTLLS programme; very little attention was paid to CTLLS because, in many cases, the provider was not yet offering these, nor to DTLLS, perhaps because, as re-structured Certificates in Education in many

cases, they are well-established in content and method and therefore perceived as less in need of study.

Taken together, the case studies include:

- Studies of providers of training in FE colleges, higher education institutions (HEI), Work based learning (WBL), Adult, Voluntary and Community learning (AVCL), offender learning, the police and fire services.
- Studies that cover a wide range of provision by size and geographical location.
- The views of teachers, tutors, trainers, teacher developers, and managers.

Summarising the case studies

This report aims to provide a succinct summary of the major issues in workforce development that emerge from the case studies. It tries to do this as much as possible through direct quotations from the studies so that their valuable insights will shine through. Inevitably, not all 81 studies, running in all to well over a thousand pages, could be quoted, however, there are ninety quotations from 39 studies, and studies from each CETT that participated are included.

The findings that emerge from the case studies

1. Fundamental challenges to the further education sector

The development of teachers is a sub-set of the development of the workforce in general, and the same challenges of employers finding the funds to release staff for development are evident. This is particularly the case in some parts of community, voluntary and work-based learning in small/medium firms.

Time is needed by teachers not only to attend ITE and engage in CPD but to complete assignments, and to engage with colleagues and reflect. Those who may need most time because they have greater development needs, such as some

vocational teachers who lack literacy and numeracy qualifications at Level 2, may be employed in areas of staff shortage where releasing staff is particularly problematic.

Time was a serious issue-all participants are currently fitting this alongside their other duties. EECETT CS 9

Weaknesses in the workplace mentor support for new teachers is a repeated criticism in Ofsted reports (2003, 2006, 2008) of initial teacher education but again case studies show that the sector faces challenges in finding resources to release staff to train as workplace mentors and to carry out the role.

A major problem in the ACL and WBL areas is lack of time for mentoring. In neither of the colleges did mentors receive remission or payment for mentoring, which is just considered to be another part of the line manager's role. Nor did they provide any training for new mentors. Westminster CETT CS 2

A further portion of DIUS funding will be used to support staff for their time in undertaking the mentoring role to colleagues who are on the teacher training course, although this will be a temporary arrangement only while the funding is available to the College. EECETT CS 3

2. The reception of the new qualifications in the Learning and Skills sector

There is almost universal support for the new qualifications as a means to raise the professional knowledge and status of teachers and to improve learning.

There is a general view that this professionalisation is long overdue and is to be welcomed. WMCETT CS 4

Professionalising staff, putting a value on teacher training and ensuring that teaching and learning is regarded as making an important contribution towards skilling up the population. CETT for Inclusive Learning CS 7

The inclusion of optional units, enabling a more personalised offer has also been well received. EMCETT Executive Summary

Although the principle of professionalising the teaching workforce through mandatory initial education and CPD has been well received, there are, inevitably with a major initiative, a number of issues that need to be addressed:

QTLS or ATLS?

There is some uncertainty about the distinction between full and associate teacher status. In turn, this may cause confusion between whether DTLLS or CTLLS is the appropriate qualification for a particular teacher:

Confusion continues to exist about the differences between CTLLS and DTLLS and who should do which qualification. Some of the official literature is vague and can suggest that anyone operating in WBL would do CTLLS on the assumption that they would not be in the full role. WMCETT Summary

A common response was to interpret status to grades of membership with the Institute for Learning without linking it to differing levels of qualifications or roles and responsibilities within the workplace. CETT for Inclusive Learning CS10

The Associate role needs further clarification although there is a clear consensus that the role is only really appropriate for assessors (only) and visiting speakers. EMCETT Executive Summary.

Of further concern, is the requirement for staff only teaching a few hours a week to obtain the full DTLLS qualification... Whereas the requirement for undertaking the Cert Ed/PGCE was determined by the number of hours a teacher taught, the new regulations set out the level of qualification required based on the role the person fulfils. This difference has still not been fully understood by some employers, including managers within FE institutions. There is a further perception that the CTLLS qualification is comparable to half the DTLLS as in the past year one of the Cert Ed carried half the credits of the full two year part-time qualification. Westminster CETT CS 3

Uncertainty about the distinction may affect the take up of CTLLS:

The Certificate to Teach in the Lifelong Learning Sector (CTLLS) will not be discussed in this study as it is not yet clear how many students are likely to opt for this qualification and there seems to be some confusion within institutions and amongst deliverers as to its true value and position. Westminster CETT CS 3

The levels of the qualifications

The levels of the qualifications – Levels 3 to 5 – may be too high for some entrants to teaching, particularly in craft vocational areas. Some case studies see a need for an additional, Level 2 entry qualification.

The biggest impact of the 2007 reforms is that the range and progressive nature of initial teacher training (ITT) has been reduced. Teachers are now only able to start their training at level 3 or 4...the majority of [vocational subject teachers] followed a vocational route to employment due to their dislike or difficulty with the academic aspects of school...These teachers are now required to pass initial qualifications at level 3 or 4 despite the government's stated minimum literacy requirement being level 2 at the end of their training. They are to use theory which requires reading and reflection skills which initially they often do not have to the appropriate level and apply this to their teaching whilst adapting to a new work environment, plan learning programmes and meet various quality assurance requirements. Westminster CETT CS 3

The requirement that PTLLS be completed within the teacher's first year

The requirement that PTLLS be completed within the teacher's first year of teaching poses more of a difficulty for work-based learning institutions which do not have in-house ITT provision. Finding programmes which run at suitable times and which staff can fit in around their classroom or training commitments are often challenges... Westminster CETT CS 3

General Professional Recognition Learning and Skills (GPRLS)

None of the case studies focused specifically on the GPRLS scheme, however, one study found that:

All providers declared that they were aware of the scope of the General Professional Recognition Scheme for experienced teachers although comments ranged from "It would be easier to re-qualify", "There is a lot of evidence required", "There does not appear to be a method of recognising prior learning", "We have sought guidance from IfL but do not appear to know". CETT for Inclusive Learning CS 7

PTLLS as a stand alone qualification?

There is clear evidence from many case studies that PTLLS are seen by many, particularly in WBL and AVCL, as a stand alone qualification. This is not the intention

of the reforms and would lead to many teachers having only 30 hours or less professional formation to teach.

There is little awareness that [PTLLS] is not a stand alone qualification ...and, indeed, is regarded by some as a suitable teaching qualification with no requirement to move onto either CTLLS or DTLLS. HUDCETT Summary

Many trainees and their sponsors thought the PTLLS award was a qualification. Not all publicity is clear about the qualification framework or the status of the PTLLS award. This confusion may be exacerbated by customized, stand alone programmes. WMCETT

Have to remember that PTLLS is only a threshold qualification! It is very easy to slide into talking about it as a stand alone qualification. Some trainees and employers think that it is. WMCETT CS 10

There is also some concern about the status of CTLLS as a stand alone qualification:

CTLLS as stand alone, it doesn't prepare people for DTLLS if their role changes. Not progressive. EMCETT

SVUK endorsement of ITE programmes

There was some concern expressed that, at the introduction of new ITE programmes – things may have improved since - the systems of endorsement of programmes required by SVUK were rather onerous:

Difficulties arose in meeting the requirements of LLUK and SVUK due to their repetitive requests for information, the challenges experienced in using LLUK specifications in course design and the ... systems employed by both organisations. EECETT Summary

IfL Registration

There appear to be no major problems with IfL registration, although there is some concern about what employers should do if staff fail to register:

The result was reassuring with 65% having at least some of their [WBL] staff registered. SWITCH CS 6

...the priority has been IfL registration, and all staff are aware of the need to register by the deadline date...a development area for the College in terms of meeting the new regulations is what approach to adopt in the event of members of staff not registering with the IfL, for whatever reasons. EECETT CS 3

Funding

There are major concerns about the availability of funding for teachers to take part in ITE and CPD:

A common theme emerging across all the case studies was that relating to the need for resources to support the professional development of the workforce. The two types of resources that were in most scarce supply were financial resources and staff time. EECETT Summary

EMCETT case studies found that:

Providers report that funding streams are over complex (LSC, Higher Education Funding Council for England (HEFCE) and Local Authority) and that neither the funding agencies or the funding protocols have caught up with the reforms of the qualification and, in particular, the staged approach.

Lack of LSC funding for PTLLS stretches the staff development budget and restricts the resourcing of in-house delivery. (ACL)

The funding mechanism should have been simplified - we are still finding that the local LEAs are not fully conversant with the awarding of grants – we appear to know more in some instances... the lack of funding for PTLLS has also put off a number of potential applicants. (FEC)

Teacher trainers are often expected to know and deal with the funding requirements of the course. Since the Local Authorities have had devolved powers over ITT funding, this has become more confusing with different boroughs/counties following different procedures... In addition to the grants or loans that students can receive to fund their training, there is also LSC and HEFCE funding which can be accessed and which employers and teacher trainers are not always aware of. Westminster CETT CS 3

Time to undertake ITE

If teachers are to fully engage with professional development, it may be necessary to look closely at how sufficient time may be provided for this. Many teachers receive little or even no remission from teaching to undertake ITE although, *Some colleges*

have acknowledged the pressures on their staff by giving them between 1 and 3 hours remission from teaching. Westminster CETT CS 3

The impact of the reforms on learners

The case studies took place at a stage in workforce reform when it was too early to say whether or not the reforms will benefit learners, although there was a general perception that reform is likely to be positive.

Staff feel positive about the impact of the reforms on their learners identifying the improved teaching and learning experience, increased focus on the learner and up to date teachers as key elements in improving learner experience. CETT for Inclusive Learning CS 1

3. The provision of Information, Advice and Guidance about the reforms

Staff development staff in “mainstream” FE may be generally content with the level of IAG:

E [Human Resources (HR) Manager in FEC] is reasonably happy with the support and information that has been available to help with embedding the ITE reforms. There is regular support at bi-monthly meetings of HR managers convened by the Association of Colleges as well as training events organised by IfL. HUDCETT CS 2

However, some case studies report that education and training providers outside “mainstream” provision, including for example the Fire Service, are uncertain about the reforms and their implications for their own provision. Any major process of reform inevitably produces lags and gaps in people’s knowledge. There is no shortage of information available about workforce reforms in the sector but accessing and comprehending it may be more difficult and some providers, especially when education provision is not their main business, may need access to a more tailored IAG service.

The Institute for Learning as a professional body needs to reach out to the work based learning community as knowledge of IfL remains unclear outside of the LSC funded sector. CETT for Inclusive Learning CS 6

APEL

Uncertainties around APEL were a particular concern:

The majority of providers were not fully confident that they knew what could be accepted and what couldn't be, in particular around Skills for Life. SWITCH CS 6

There is confusion also about the standing of CTLLS and the regulations on transferability and Accreditation of Prior Learning (APL) of the 24 credits from CTLLS to the remaining 96 credits of the full DTLLS (or Certificate in Education). HUDCETT Summary

Issues and concerns emerged regarding the importance of further detail around Accreditation of Prior Learning (APL), including the interface between the Learning & Development NVQs and other qualifications in common currency within WBL, Offender Learning and FE. SWITCH Summary

All providers stated that they were aware of the SVUK tariff of legacy qualification database but comments ranged from "Not sure how it is going to work in relation to certain qualifications" to "Very complicated... we are looking to see how we can distil the information into something that staff can both understand and retain. CETT for Inclusive Learning CS7

There may be a role for CETTs, or for FECs , in the provision of IAG because:

A recurring message is around the value of maximising the use of existing networks (partnerships and key relationships) to promote the dissemination of information and to support and promote understanding of the reforms, their implications and ways to address implementing them. SWITCH Summary

4. Delivery of the new qualifications

In general, teachers have high regard for the programmes that deliver the new qualifications, many of which are available at flexible times to fit in with other work commitments. The knowledge and support of ITE tutors is valued and even highly experienced teachers who may feel compelled to take a course, report favourably on the experience:

L [a full-time teacher with 18 years experience] described the course as "wonderful" and said she especially liked the IT sessions and finding out about theories of learning and how they apply to practice. She noted that she has become much more confident as a teacher. Success North CS 10

Teachers particularly value the development of their practical skills (remember though that most case studies report on PTLLS) and feedback from lesson observations. PTLLS + (Warwick/WMCEET) offer workplace teaching observations at additional cost to the employer and report that these are particularly highly regarded. This is not part of normal observation provision, however, which is based on micro-teaching that can take up a large (some say disproportionate) part of a PTLLS programme.

PTLLS courses are attended both by experienced teachers and also by people who are considering entering teaching. Providing differentiated learning may be challenging as one group have experience to draw upon for assignments, and the other may not. This adds a new challenge to personalisation which already exists in all ITE programmes because of differences in previous educational attainment, subject taught, and the context and level of teaching.

For instance, EECETT CS 2 found that 52% of those who responded to a survey on a PTLLS course were non-teaching but that, *There did not seem to be a great deal of [course provision] differentiation between those who were teachers and those who were not.*

The case studies point to a number of other development issues, including:

A need to find ways to support the transition onto programmes, including bridging the gap between PTLLS and CTLLS (and/or DTLLS) SWITCH Summary

A need for Local Authorities and other employers of ACL tutors to take a collegial and strategic approach to the ITE/CPD needs of their staff to counter the dispersed and isolated local contexts in which these teachers tend to work. SUNCETT CS 8

The place of education theory in ITE

Both teaching and non-teaching respondents felt the amount of theory split into different topics made it difficult to focus on their own practice or how this would affect them when starting to teach...Respondents felt that although the word count requirement for each of these theory aspects was relatively low the need to discuss and understand each in a teaching environment needed longer time than was able to be scheduled in a 10 week course. EECETT CS 2

Other studies of ITE (Harkin, 2005; Harkin *et al*, 2008) recommend greater clarity and consistency in the content of ITE programmes. In the absence of a national view, each course may offer idiosyncratic content and process to teachers. In PTLLS programmes it may be appropriate to introduce only a minimum of theory while focusing almost exclusively on practical classroom or workshop strategies and skills. CTLLS and DTLLS programmes, but especially the latter, may be more suited to the development of teachers' underpinning knowledge of theories of teaching and learning.

Examples of effective Practice

There are a number of examples of effective practice in ITE delivery, such as this from WMCETT CS 4:

- The College's Preparatory Education Programme (PEP) which deals with entry issues including initial assessment prior to trainees starting the programme
- The high level of trainee support available including the provision of mentors and the opportunity to access the College's specialist services
- The release of staff in paid time to undertake the Programme
- Access to a quality learning environment
- The ability of teacher-educators to be flexible in programme delivery
- The organisation's determination to implement the new framework and its commitment to a culture of professional development
- The availability of information about the Programme on the College's website
- Teaching observation in the 'real' classroom

If sufficient funds are available, bespoke packages of induction and support may be effective in preparing new entrants to teaching where there is difficulty recruiting in a sector with high levels of well-paid employment. EECETT CS 7 reports a generously funded programme that recruited six new teachers from the Construction industry, five of whom have taken up full-time posts. Each individual was mentored and coached over a 12-15 month probationary period and given a light timetable with periods for study activity each week

Meeting the needs of WBL and AVCL providers

A theme emerges from several of the case studies that those working in WBL and third sector contexts have concerns about the current appropriateness of FE / HE ITT delivery to trainee teachers from their contexts. This relates both to the accessibility of provision, in terms of where and when it takes place, and to the understanding of non-FE teaching & learning contexts and the ability of the ITT programmes to reflect this effectively. SWITCH Summary

SWITCH case study 6 involved key contacts of 48 Work-based training providers, the majority based in small to medium companies. Between them, they were using 966 training staff (c130 of whom were in ITE training or signed up for ITE). Among other things, the study found that the numbers requiring ITE programmes from the WBL sector might be higher than anticipated, partly because experienced trainers leave for better conditions of service within FE colleges. Among the recommendations of the study are that ITE programmes run by colleges need to tailor provision more to the needs of WBL and that CETTS should reach out more to the wider sector.

As Human Resources manager, Mary is not fully confident that the Teacher Training reforms have been fully addressed or implemented by the ACL provider where she works. The main reason for this is that there are, as common in Adult and Community Learning providers, a huge number of sessional tutors employed by the organisation; keeping track of their qualification profile can be very difficult. HUDCETT CS 1

Work based mentoring and optional units in ITE

The lack of provision of suitable workplace, subject-specific, mentors (a repeated criticism in Ofsted reports of initial teacher education) is a limiting factor in effective provision of ITE. This is especially the case for small, non-mainstream employers and for workplaces asked to mentor teachers from outside the organisation. Many organisations lack staffing levels to provide mentors, or line managers may mentor as part of a wider role but with variable effectiveness.

The provision of suitably selected and trained workplace mentors may be the single most important challenge to emerge from the case studies. In the absence of subject-specific mentoring, there are calls from some teachers for the ITE

programmes themselves to become less generic and more subject-specific. Whilst it may be feasible for ITE tutors to have a broader understanding of the different parts of the Learning and Skills sector, it is quite impossible for them to have more than a fleeting acquaintance with the myriad subjects delivered in the sector. Only where a relatively large cohort of teachers from one specific area can be brought together for several years is it feasible to provide subject-specific training. Furthermore, it is not necessarily desirable to have staff from one sub-sector professionally developed with little or no contact with people outside. This used to be the case, for example, with police training but, as HUDCETT CS 4 shows, it is now Home Office policy that police officers in a training role are developed outside the police service, alongside teachers from other areas of work. This is perceived as good for the individual teachers by, for example, extending their repertoire of teaching strategies, and also healthier for the culture from which they come.

There is a stronger case to argue for an extension of and easier access to optional units on CTLLS and DTLLS programmes so that, for example, prison educators may access specialised modules on behaviour management, however, even this more modest proposal poses difficulties. Not all prison educators would agree that they need separate and additional provision; and they may disagree about what additional professional development they may need.

If suitable workplace mentors could be trained and provided to ITE teachers as a matter of course, then there may be less need to extend generic programmes. The next section expands on some of the mentoring issues.

5. Mentoring teachers during ITE

Mentoring arrangements need to improve. It all depends on the quality and motivation of the mentor. WMCETT CS 8

Mainstream providers such as FECs usually have staff roles, such as Subject-Learning coaches or Advanced Practitioners, that include an element of mentoring, however, this may not always or even usually be provided to staff undergoing ITE. Newly appointed staff, or staff who have had poor Ofsted grades may be more likely

to receive mentoring. Line managers may be called upon to help; or teachers may often simply be left to their own devices to find a mentor. Some ITE programmes only accept candidates who have made suitable mentoring arrangements, despite the difficulties that may be found in finding a suitable and willing mentor. Practice varies widely and some organisations may have put in place effective mentoring arrangements, including some work based ITE providers:

It must be appreciated that the wbl sector already has extensive use of the mentor system in the workplace, it being seen as an important way of overcoming some of the obstacles of delivery in the workplace. SWITCH CS 6

However, great diversity in practice is the norm:

M 1 [an FE manager] suggests that his school 'dabbles' in mentoring. He further suggests that it is not really taken seriously across the College. He sees no central direction, no one driving policy or given the responsibility to do so. The main problem M1 sees to recruiting mentors is lack of incentive. If there is no pay, no timetable remission, there is no incentive apart from personal satisfaction....a marked diversity of provision exists between participant organisations in their mentoring policy. Some institutions ensure that all new teachers are automatically provided with mentors; others seem to operate on what might be termed a 'deficit model' only providing mentors to staff who appear to be underperforming; usually but not always, at inspection. Success North CS 4

Manager 2 is a Head of School in a large FE college in the North East of England where he is responsible for 104 staff, 85 of whom he expects to be affected by the reforms. He saw problems with the idea of providing mentors for all new staff. 'Where are they going to come from? What qualifications will they have? There are no advanced practitioners, no senior lecturer grades. No funding, no remission.' Success North CS 5

...organisations ..should be proactive in identifying, selecting and training mentors well in advance, especially as mentors are often allotted at the last minute. They should draw up appropriate selection criteria for mentors and give both status and kudos to the role. Cunningham 2007 quoted in Westminster CETT CS 2

L chose her own mentor. This was seen as very valuable by L but she noted that it is currently based on goodwill. The mentor has a full timetable and, although technically she can claim her mentoring time back, in practice this rarely happens. Success North CS 10

The funding of mentoring

There is a real issue surrounding the lack of funding to support the training of mentors and it was felt that this could "...have an impact on implementation of the reforms." In addition to this there are concerns as to whether appropriate support and time would

be made available for suitably qualified and experienced staff to act as subject specialist mentors for their colleagues. CETT for Inclusive Learning CS 6

...mentoring is not a cheap option that will work without considerable time and commitment, how can this be sustained over a longer period of time? EECETT CS 6

The DIUS and the QIA [sic – the appropriate body currently is the LSC] must monitor more closely the use of their funding to support ITE activities for new and qualifying teachers. They must ensure that a proportion of this funding is used to provide remission or payment for mentoring in the ACL and WBL, either directly to mentors; or indirectly to CETTs who could provide mentors where none are available for the trainee. ... All mentors must be given a minimum of 20 hours pay or equivalent remission from teaching or managerial duties per mentee for the role. Westminster CETT CS 2

Developing mentors

Once mentors are identified and given some time for the role, there remains an issue of professional development of mentors, that may in some cases be linked to their own need to fulfil the 30 hours a year CPD requirement to comply with IfL registration.

Mentor training should form part of the Institute for Learning's annual CPD requirement and HEIs should allow for the accreditation (at Post-Graduate or Masters level) of such professional learning. Westminster CETT CS 2

Allocation of a 'super' mentor to mentors to model good practice and be an immediate port of call in case of difficulty...Coordination and recording of CPD for mentors, mentees and teacher education practitioners/mentor trainers. EECETT CS 6

In the light of the variations in mentor support, LLUK commissioned research (Hardman *et al*, 2008) to identify:

- Future and emerging needs in relation to mentoring and coaching to inform national planning.
- Existing coaching and mentoring activities in the CETTS [Eg research, development of qualifications, training programmes and training materials]
- New developments in coaching and mentoring that are planned
- Findings/outcomes from activities to date

The report found that,

In ITT, there is a wide variation in models, practices and approaches and lack of consensus about what should be in place and that Levels of resourcing tend to be low and highly variable between providers - the provision largely operates on the basis of goodwill; take up of mentor training is low due to lack of release.

One of the recommendations of the report was that LLUK should clarify what the minimum levels of support for trainees should be - regardless of their provider; and should produce clearer guidance for employers on how to support teachers in their professional development.

6. The assessment of the new qualifications

Initial assessment

There is evidence of wide variation in initial assessment practice and uncertainty about how to make use of the results. WMCETT, for example, reports that:

Initial assessment practice was very varied: where tests were taken as part of the programme it was noted that, "the initial assessment methods used (diagnostic tests) took too long and didn't take account of trainees' previous learning and experience" (WMCETT CS 1,3.

The purpose and position of initial assessment within PTLLS is unclear. Initial assessment inevitably identifies a range of learning needs which a programme of this size cannot address or support. "It was unsatisfactory and I want to change it and build in a proper initial assessment tutorial." Teacher educator WMCETT CS10

The burden of assessment on PTLLS

PTLLS is more demanding than its credit value warrants. EMCETT Executive Summary

There is a widespread feeling that PTLLS, which are the focus of many case studies, are over-assessed. Typically, a PTLLS programme will include 8 -14 pieces of assessed work which is burdensome for teachers and their tutors. If PTLLS is

intended to be a 30 hour introduction to teaching, is this burden of assessment excessive?

This may be particularly problematic for teachers of craft vocational subjects who have difficulty with their own level of literacy; and for teachers who receive little or no remission to attend ITE and who have to attend the course, complete assignments, and do a full teaching/other work load in the rest of the week.

The principal, recurring issue raised by project partners, as providers of ITE, is the increased workload for tutors delivering the programmes. The extra demands were consistently associated with the PTLLS programme, whether delivered as a stand-alone or embedded within a certificate or diploma. Specifically, this extra demand has arisen from the amount of learning content and assessment (including micro-teaching) that has to be delivered within the programme. What is also clear is the assessment regimes vary according to the awarding body. EMCETT Executive Summary

The assessment requirements of the PTLLS programme seem in some cases to be disproportionate to the size of the programme. For example, trainees identified 9 assignments in one and others indicated that twenty hours of additional study was required. This may indicate that the programmes need to carry more credits where a greater depth of assessment is required. It could be argued that as the original intention of PTLLS was to be an 'induction' into a qualifying programme all the assessment within PTLLS should be diagnostic and formative in nature. WMCETT

Other assessment issues raised include whether the standard of achievement at the end of initial training is sufficiently assured:

There's always been an assumption because of funding, because of numbers that teacher educators will take the poorer people and shove them through....some student teachers are not ready to progress to full teaching qualification even after two years of part time study or one year of full time study. It may be worthwhile to consider how such teachers could exit with a CTTL qualification and a CPD development plan outlining the range of professional knowledge, practical teaching, literacy/numeracy/ICT skills requiring further development before they could be considered for another period of study leading to the award of full QTLS. SUNCETT CS 7

Although this suggestion risks confusing CTLS as a full qualification for a role with CTLLS as a half way house, nevertheless the principle raised is valid – do some teachers need further structured CPD before attaining either ATLS or QTLS and, if so, how may this be provided?

There was also some concern about the nature of assessment of PTLLS and whether it is too simplistic:

The PTLLS assessment may be too simplistic, undermining the credibility of professional training and also failing to prepare candidates adequately for progression. WMCETT CS 2

Encourage awarding bodies to reduce emphasis on written assignments and develop more flexible approaches to evidence of higher order thinking skills. Westminster CETT CS 3

Teaching observations

Additional assessment pressure is being placed on PTLLS/CTLLS/DTLLS tutors by the (awarding body) requirement for tutors rather than mentors or appropriately qualified managers to carry out observations. Again, this situation varies according to which awarding body makes the award. EMCETT Executive Summary

On PTLLS there is no requirement to make work based teaching observations, although Warwick/WMCETT PTLLS+ programmes do carry out work based observations at additional cost to employers. As the benefits of good quality feedback from observations in context are well known, it is unsurprising that teachers value the observations. In most PTLLS programmes teaching is only observed within the programme through micro teaching. As a cautionary note, it is worth considering whether carrying out work based observations on a PTLLS programme, such as happens in PTLLS+, may encourage some employers to regard PTLLS as a stand alone, sufficient qualification to teach.

7. Support for teachers of functional skills

Trainees were given different information about the requirements relating to the levels of numeracy/literacy they will be required to attain and by when. Some were told that they must have NQF level two in numeracy and literacy in order to gain access to a DTLLS programme. Others were told that they had five years to develop their skills – but must have confirmation of their level in order to register for QTLS with IFL. WMCETT CS10

Teachers of SfL and ESOL take a separate, specialist teaching qualification, however, especially with the development of 14-19 Diplomas, many teachers need to develop their learners' functional skills in literacy, numeracy and ICT. Teachers also

need confidence in their own ability and, since 2001, the minimum core requirements for teachers in the learning and skills sector are GCSE English and Maths at Grade C or above or at Key Skills Level 2 for Communication and Application of Number.

There is a requirement that by the end of their CTLLS or DTLLS training, teachers will have achieved at least Level 2 in literacy and numeracy, however, all candidates, even for PTLLS, need at least this level in literacy to be able to cope with reading and the writing of course assignments. It may therefore be necessary to offer pre-course help to some people to enable them to cope with ITE.

Two out of three trainees were identified through initial assessment as requiring support in literacy and numeracy... Trainees from FE colleges are more likely to be able to access this kind of support. But those from WBL/ACL/Voluntary sector are likely to find that they are not able to find support unless they enrol on a Skills for Life programme. Ironically, it is the WBL/ACL trainees who most need this help. Many have the same skills development needs as their own students. WMCETT

There is a concern amongst deliverers about the level of literacy amongst students undertaking their teacher training. Westminster CETT CS 3

...responses highlighted concerns about the personal (i.e. SfL) skills and, particularly, the academic skills of trainees on the diploma programme. EMCETT Executive Summary

Contributors also noted uncertainties about what constituted a satisfactory standard in ICT skills, particularly since those training to be school teachers are required to demonstrate a level 2 competence in English, Mathematics and ICT. Teacher educator WMCETT CS 3

Some case studies report the integration of functional skills support into ITE programmes but this does not seem to be the norm. The ITE programmes themselves are already heavily time constrained and it is difficult to see how they can easily integrate the development of functional skills, especially as many teachers already have high levels of these skills and need no further help.

The personalisation agenda is, therefore, important here – how do ITE programmes tailor provision to meet the needs of individual teachers and ensure that teachers have the knowledge to help their own learners with functional skills?

The college has standards set at initial interview regarding support of learners, particularly with regards to Language, Literacy and Numeracy (LLN), however as an organisation there is a need to ensure that all tutors have a (perhaps incremental) set of support skills... EECETT CS 8

Additional support for some teachers to develop their own (and in turn their learners') functional skills may need additional funding:

Introduce funded teacher training support for trainee teachers who do not have the appropriate academic skills. Westminster CETT CS 3

The Diploma for teachers of Skills for Life

Further clarity is felt to be needed around the detail of the future regarding Functional Skills, Key Skills and Skills for Life, as well as guidance about to whom the additional Skills for Life qualification requirements apply. Are Functional Skills staff and / or Skills for Life Assessors encompassed by requirements to gain additional SfL related qualifications / units? SWITCH Summary

Skills for Life tutors used to take a Level 4 certificate which may sometimes have emphasised the development of personal skills more than the ability to develop learners' skills, as the following anecdote illustrates:

I found an incredible buzz in that proud moment of conquering calculus... Nothing was going to stand in my way now in becoming a well qualified and numerate Skills for Life Tutor... The high of overcoming calculus however was replaced with the dumbfounding low of what was to follow... [faced] with the task of teaching subtraction to my group of Entry Level 3 learners, I proceeded to die a slow and painful death in front of them which will live with me for ever... How on earth do you possibly take away the big number on the bottom from that smaller number on the top? SUNCETT CS 9

The Level 4 certificate has been replaced by a Level 5 Diploma [DTLLS] with less emphasis on developing personal numeracy skills but there is now an entry requirement that candidates must demonstrate personal numeracy skills at level 3.

. ... This may prove to be a considerable barrier to many applicants. .. none of the applicants for the first cohort of the Level 5 Diploma having a qualification above Level 2 and a similar picture is emerging from applications for the second cohort. SUNCETT CS 9

Consideration will have to be given to the requirements on tutors to undertake formal training on embedding LLN support into their vocational specialism. This, currently set at Level 5, may be daunting to many part-time tutors; requiring a substantial time and personal commitment to complete and with no professional recognition in pay or status it may prove a challenge to the college to deliver a workforce certificated to the standards. It was challenging to recruit to, and retain vocational tutors to the Level 3

qualification – so any viable pre-Level 5 alternatives would therefore be welcomed.
EECETT CS 8

To address this problem, some colleges have introduced bridging courses:

The Lightbulb Project is ...providing a bridge to Level 5 programmes in embedding Literacy and Numeracy. It is accredited by ABC as a Level 3 Certificate in Facilitating Learning and participants achieve the National Certificates in Literacy and Numeracy at Level 2. It was designed to meet the needs of staff who want to 'brush up' their own skills, and be introduced to a range of alternative ways to support learners to develop Skills for Life and Key Skills. As part of the project participants receive a Continuing Professional Development (CPD) portfolio which contains a full set of teaching resources. (For more information visit <http://www.skillsforlife-sw.org.uk/>) SWITCH CS 2

8. Progression issues in the qualifications framework

Once a teacher has registered with IfL they have 5 years in which to reach QTLS or ATLS status. For the full teacher role this includes level 2 qualifications in English and Mathematics (GCSE Grade c or above or equivalent) and level 3 qualifications in their teaching subject(s). For some teachers who begin with much lower levels of qualification (or with no recognised qualification, e.g. pedal cycle maintenance) this timeline may be too short, however, the number of teachers for whom this is the case may be small. CETTs have been asked to pass any data they have to IfL.

There is also some uncertainty about progression from PTLLS (can it be a stand alone qualification contrary to its intended role as an introductory qualification?) and from CTLLS to DTLLS and what counts for APEL purposes.

...they [work based providers'] felt the step up to the CTLLS level from the PTLLS was going to represent a major hurdle for a number of their staff who were predominantly drawn from vocational backgrounds. Support in aiding this transition was something they were hoping for. SWITCH CS 7

The professional formation of teachers takes more than one or two years – it may take several more years for a novice teacher to become proficient. What help is routinely available for newly qualified teachers? ITE programmes, and the CPD processes being put in place by the IfL, are based on the principle of reflective

practice. How much time do newly qualified teachers have to reflect and to continue to develop their ability to teach and to support learning? Should there be a probationary year as is the case with school teachers? If so, how would this fit with staff who are already in post and attending in-service ITE?

“Another interesting thing with the old LEA system required the Principal to sign you off after the first year. That’s all gone now.” (CPD Manager) SUNCETT CS 7

IfL registration

There were a few reported problems with IfL registration and the adjustments necessary to internal systems of recording CPD:

All three providers claimed to have systems to track and record CPD. CETT for Inclusive Learning CS 7

The absence of firm information concerning the level of CPD required to maintain IfL registration was a cause for concern and the College looked forward to a clarification of this issue. CETT for Inclusive Learning CS 1

It is clear from the response from teachers, tutors etc. that there is confusion about the on line tracking of CPD with IfL. Some further guidance would be of benefit or a refresh of the initial guidance should be considered... As regards sessional staff, who is responsible for co-ordinating their CPD and who pays for it? CETT for Inclusive Learning CS 8

Several of the employers sampled expressed a need to harmonise the internal systems for recording CPD with the IfL electronic process but, again, there was also evidence of a perceived lack of clarity regarding the detail of the national process. EMCETT Executive Summary

What counts as CPD?

Work based providers in particular may need help to understand and comply with the CPD requirements of the IfL:

This provider would like to see a Work Based Learning sector membership within the IfL. SWITCH CS 8

FE colleges may be better placed to respond to ways of developing personalised systems of CPD:

[A] College set up a Workforce Reforms group with senior management representation and met regularly to develop a Professional Development Portfolio (PDP) for use by all teaching and support staff...“I think if we want to be treated as professionals then this record keeping is part of the deal but more importantly if we have a positive attitude towards it then we can really use it to focus ourselves and make sure that we do stuff that will develop us well. “SWITCH CS 4

...one of the themes extending across the case studies has been exploring ways in which professional development can become more personalised [through for example] the use of action learning sets as a form of professional development ...All participants felt that the potential for this form of CPD activity was phenomenal as it could focus very closely on issues that related specifically to individuals and their own practice. EECETT Summary

More work is needed on processes of conducting and recording CPD and an LLUK/ACER report (Fiddy, 2008) on access to CPD clarifies what counts as CPD, who directs it, and how it is recorded. In a nutshell, almost anything counts, CPD is mainly self-directed by the teacher, and there is an IfL recording system (Reflect). Some HR departments may need to bring into line their existing systems of recording CPD and many are currently doing so.

9. The recruitment and development of teacher educators

The new qualifications are delivered by teacher educators who, as a group, are not representative of the Learning and Skills workforce. They are mainly female, mainly come from Business, Arts and Humanities backgrounds, are often appointed informally through collegial networks, and have a wide variety of professional formation as teacher educators - from virtually none to doctorates in education. (Noel, 2006; Harkin *et al*, 2008) They may choose to focus in their teaching on virtually any aspect of education so that one may emphasise learning styles and another ignore them; one spend much time on developing teachers' understanding of formative assessment and another relatively little time.

A subordinate but crucially important theme within this case study draws attention to the absence of a consensus in terms of a recognised body of professional knowledge

which sets out what teacher educators in the UK need to know and how well they need to know it in order to be able to teach the subject of pedagogy in PCET. SUNCETT Summary

Bearing in mind the high regard that most teachers have for the ITE they receive, it may be argued that not much needs to change in the formation of teacher educators, however, some of the systemic challenges to implementing the workforce reforms may not be overcome without a broader range of teachers becoming teacher educators through a more deliberative process of professional formation.

A programme of teacher educator programmes are introduced ensuring that the base knowledge required to teach on any ITT course is identified. HUDCETT Summary recommendation

We wait with interest whether there will be a national framework for training and development for teacher educators...which should ensure rigour, consistency and quality in teacher training. CETT for Inclusive Learning CS 6

SUNCETT is trialling a new model for the professional development of teacher educators and a report (Harkin *et al*, 2008) on the developmental needs of teacher educators has recommended the creation of a Teacher Educator Development group to, among other things, refine a model of the knowledge, skills and attributes needed by teacher educators in the sector and develop optional Units of Assessment within the QCF at Levels 6 and 7, upon which Awarding Bodies and HEIs may base programmes of professional development.

10. The role of CETTs in promoting workforce reform

This is not a factor that emerges directly from many case studies but indirectly a potential role for the CETTs (which some may already fulfil or exceed) does emerge, including:

- Providing more tailored information, advice and guidance that helps organisations across the sector to orientate their workforce developments to the reform agenda, map their staff development needs, and provide suitable professional development.

- Providing CPD opportunities, possibly tailored to the specific needs of learning providers, especially in WBL and AVCL, who have very limited capacity.
- Acting as a catalyst for promoting and disseminating good practice in staff development, including workplace mentoring, inclusive learning, recording CPD, etc.
- Acting as a network centre or hub to bring together teachers and organisations to share and develop best practice in learning.

CETTs, of course, do already recognise such a role. For example:

The intention of the CETT for Inclusive Learning is to "...provide a source of expertise for those who teach and support learners with learning difficulties and/or disabilities (LDD) and this encompasses Skills for Life." ... The CETT needs to reach out to a wider community in order to become more accessible. CETT for Inclusive Learning

EECETT's mission is to play an active role in disseminating and supporting the development of good practice within the raft of new teacher training qualifications and continuing professional development (CPD) requirements throughout the sector. The intention is to improve the quality of teacher training, especially within the workplace context and to increase the capacity of the sector to respond to skills needs. EECETT Summary

The CETT recognised that regional colleagues needed additional support as existing national helplines were not fulfilling all key needs and there was still uncertainty about the reforms in some contexts. One of the challenges was that many colleagues affected by the reforms didn't recognise themselves as 'teachers' and didn't, therefore, realise that the reforms applied to them. This, in particular, applied to those delivering Train to Gain. SWitch CETT

References

- Cunningham, B. (2007) "All the right features: towards an 'architecture' for mentoring trainee teachers in UK further education colleges" *Journal of Education for Teaching* 33:1, 83 – 97.
- DfES (2002) *Success For All: Reforming Further Education and Training - Our Vision for the Future*. London: DfES November 2002.
- DfES (2004) *Equipping our Teachers for the Future: Reforming Initial Teacher Training for the Learning and Skills Sector*. London: DfES November 2004.
- DfES (2006) *FE Reform: Raising Skills, Improving Life Chances*. London: DCSF March 2006.
- Fiddy, R. (2008) Access to Effective and Equitable Continuing Professional Development Opportunities for Teachers, Tutors and Trainers in the Lifelong Learning Sector. London: LLUK.
- Hardman, J., Knight, S. & Hankey, J. (2008 – not yet published) Coaching and mentoring in the Lifelong Learning Sector in England. London: LLUK.
- Harkin, J. (2005) Fragments Stored Against My Ruin: the place of educational theory in the professional development of teachers, *The Journal of Vocational Education and Training*, 57, 2, pp. 165-179.
- Harkin J, Cuff A, and Rees. S (2008 - not yet published) *Research into the Developmental Needs of Teacher Educators for Effective Implementation of the New Qualifications for Teachers, Tutors and Trainers in the Lifelong Learning Sector in England*. London: LLUK
- Noel, P. (2006) The secret life of teacher educators: becoming a teacher educator in the learning and skills sector, *Journal of Vocational Education and Training*, 58, 2, pp. 151–170.
- Ofsted (2003) The Initial Training of Further Education Teachers.
- Ofsted (2006) The Initial Training of Further Education Teachers: Findings From 2004-05 Inspections of Courses Leading to National Awarding Body Qualifications.
- Ofsted (2008) The Initial Training of Further Education Teachers: Findings From 2006-07 Inspections of Courses Leading to National Awarding Body Qualifications.

Appendix

The CETTs that produced case study reports and their abbreviations

Westminster Partnership CETT	-	Westminster CETT
CETT for Inclusive Learning	-	CETT for Inclusive Learning
East of England CETT	-	EECETT
West Midlands CETT	-	WMCETT
East Midlands CETT	-	EMCETT
Huddersfield CETT	-	HUDCETT
South West CETT	-	SWITCH
Success North CETT	-	Success North
University of Sunderland CETT	-	SUNCETT